

National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation Ltd.
(Technical division)

Minutes of 2nd Meeting of Empowered Technical Bid Evaluation Committee (ETEC) for Evaluation of Technical Bid for "Short term improvement & Routine maintenance of Ukhrul-Jessami-Nagaland Border (km 126) in the state of Manipur on Item rate basis" at NHIDCL, New Delhi on 08.05.2018-Technical Bid Evaluation-req

- 1) The RFPs for the subject work were invited with bid due date as 10.04.2018 till 1500 hrs.
- 2) In all 04 (four) proposals were received from the firms viz. M/s ABCI Infrastructures Pvt. Ltd., M/s HVS Construction Materials Pvt. Ltd., M/s Nidhi Creative Infrastructure Pvt. Ltd. and M/s Garg Sons Estate Promoters Pvt. Ltd. The bids were opened accordingly by Empowered Technical Bid Opening Committee (ETBC) on 11.04.2018 in the presence of bidders' representatives who chose to attend.
- 3) The ETBC recommended that the bids of the aforesaid 04 (four) bidders be technically evaluated to judge the technical responsiveness of bids from the financial consultant M/s Gianendra & Associates. Accordingly, the bids were handed over to the financial consultant M/s Gianendra & Associates for evaluation and the financial consultant submitted the report vide letter dated 16.04.2018.
- 4) The Committee vide Minutes of Meeting dated 16.04.2018 deliberated the report in detail and perused the report of financial consultant vide which the financial consultant recommended to seek clarifications from the aforesaid bidders. Accordingly the clarifications were sought from respective bidders vide letter dated 20.04.2018.
- 5) Based on the reply of the bidders, the financial consultant submitted its report vide letter dated 01.05.2018. The committee deliberated the report of financial consultant and the comments of financial consultant vis-a-vis ETEC is tabulated below:
 - a) M/s ABCI Infrastructures Pvt Ltd

S. No.	Appendix / Annex No.	Observations	Reply of Bidder	Comments of financial consultant	Comments of ETEC
1.	Appendix to Clause 4.4 (b) (i)	Bidder has claimed in the Annexure-F (LIST OF EQUIPMENT TO BE DEPOLYED) that 6 Tipper trucks are available against required 10 Tipper Trucks. However, invoices for 10 Tipper truck are found to be submitted. Bidder to clarify.	As per requirement of the tender we will deploy 10 Tipper Trucks and if necessary more but inadvertently it has been mentioned 5 which is typographical error. The invoices of 10 Tippers have been submitted with our bid and we are also attaching the same herewith.	As the Bidder has confirmed that it was typo error, the same is accepted and bidder is considered for evaluation.	Agreed
2.	Appendix to Clause 4.4 (b) (i)	Bidder has claimed in the Annexure-F (LIST OF EQUIPMENT TO BE DEPOLYED) that 2 Water Tanker are available against required 3 Water Tanker. However, invoices for 6 Water Tanker are found to be submitted. Bidder to clarify.	As per requirement of the tender we will deploy 3 Water tankers and if necessary more but inadvertently it has been mentioned 2 which is typographical error. The invoices of 3 Water tanks have been submitted with our bid and we are also attaching the same herewith.	As the Bidder has confirmed that it was typo error, the same is accepted and bidder is considered for evaluation.	Agreed

Ajay A

High

Amir

R. P. S.

Shw

S. No.	Appendix / Annex No.	Observations	Reply of Bidder	Comments of financial consultant	Comments of ETEC
3.	Appendix to Clause 4.4 (b) (i)	Bidder has claimed in the Annexure-F (LIST OF EQUIPMENT TO BE DEPOLYED) that 2 Front End Loader are available against required 2 Front End Loader. However, invoices for only 1 Front End Loader are found to be submitted. Bidder to clarify.	As per requirement of the tender we will deploy 2 Front End Loader and if necessary more. The invoices of 2 Front End Loader have been submitted in page no. 100 and 101 of our bid and we are also attaching the same herewith.	As the Bidder has confirmed that it was typo error, the same is accepted and bidder is considered for evaluation.	Agreed
4.	Appendix to Clause 4.4 (b) (i)	Bidder has proposed Debanjan Dey for the post of Soil & Material Engineer in Annexure G (KEY PERSONNEL PROPOSED). However, Resume of Biswajit Chanda is submitted as proposed Soil & Material Engineer. Further, in the resume of Biswajit Chanda it is mentioned that the key personnel has been working in the firm i.e. M/s ABCI Infrastructures Pvt Ltd from 05.01.1992 to till date. Whereas, Date of Incorporation of M/s ABCI Infrastructures Pvt Ltd is 12.03.1993. Bidder to clarify.	Due to Oversight and Typographical Error DEBANJAN DEY has been shown as Site Engineer as well as Soil & Material Engineer. He will be working as Site Engineer. Besides BiswajitChanda will he working as Soil and Material Engineer. He has been working with this firm since 1992 when this was only a proprietary firm which was later taken over and incorporated as Pvt. Ltd. company in 1993.	The Bidder has confirmed that DEBANJAN DEY was written due to typo error and BiswajitChanda will be working as Soil and Material Engineer. Further it was clarified that He has been working with this firm since 1992 when this was only a proprietary firm which was later taken over and incorporated as Pvt. Ltd. company in 1993. The same is accepted.	Agreed
5.	25% value of work	Bidder has submitted Undertaking regarding 25% value of the work during implementation of the Contract towards the working capital. However, the said undertaking is not Notarized which was required to be Notarized as per RFP. Bidder to clarify.	We are attaching herewith an Undertaking regarding 25% value of the work during implementation of the Contract towards the working Capital duly Notarized	As the Bidder has now submitted Undertaking regarding 25% value of the work during implementation of the Contract towards the working Capital duly Notarized, the same is accepted.	Agreed

b) M/s HVS Construction Materials Pvt. Ltd.

S. No.	Appendix / Annex No.	Observations	Reply of Bidder	Comments of financial consultant	Comments of ETEC
1.	Form of Application &	Bidder has executed Power of Attorney dated 07.04.2018 authorising Mr. H.	Clarification to point no. 1- There was a	As the Bidder has confirmed that it was a	Agreed

Agreed *Agreed* *Agreed* *Agreed*

S. No.	Appendix / Annex No.	Observations	Reply of Bidder	Comments of financial consultant	Comments of ETEC
	Undertakings	Vikramjit Singh. Whereas following documents have been signed on 06.04.2018 which is before the execution date. Form of Application. Undertaking for Key Equipments. Undertaking to Abide by Bid. Bidder to clarify.	typing error, therefore kindly consider the date on 7.4.18.	typo error, the same is accepted and Bidder is considered for further evaluation.	
2.	Clause 4.4 (A) (b)	Project 1 to 4 Bidder has claimed four projects under Clause 4.4 (A) (b). Wherein the Bidder has not clarified which project is claimed under "Experience in successfully completing or substantially completing at least one contract of road i.e. State Highway, National Highway with similar or higher Bituminous work specification of at least 40% of value of proposed Contract within the last five years". Bidder to clarify.	Clarification to point no. 2 - While uploading for similar work proper folder was not specified however Job no. 039-MN-2011-12-81 dated 31.03.2012 to be consider as similar work as uploaded.	As the Bidder has provided requisite information, the evaluation has been carried out accordingly.	Agreed
3.	Clause 4.2 (a)	Bidder has not provided the Constitution or Legal Status & Principal place of business in the scanned documents submitted which was required to be submitted as per Clause 4.2 (a) which stipulates that "Scanned copies of original documents defining the constitution or legal status, place of registration, and principal place of business; scanned copy of written power of attorney of the signatory of the Bid to commit the Bidder; & original copy of Written Power of attorney to be submitted in the envelop of physical form. (Refer clause 12.2 of ITB)". Bidder to clarify.	Clarification to point no. 3- Certificate for incorporation is already uploaded and hardcopy is submitted as per clause 12.2 of ITB.	As the bidder has submitted Certificate for legal status as private limited Company and principal place of Business as Assam, Meghalaya, Manipur, Tripura, Nagaland, Arunachal Pradesh & Mizoram, Shillong. The same is accepted.	Agreed

c) M/s Nidhi Creative Infrastructure Pvt. Ltd.

S. No.	Appendix / Annex No.	Observations	Reply of Bidder	Comments of financial consultant	Comments of ETEC
1.	Clause 4.4 B (b) (ii)	Bidder has submitted an Affidavit regarding deployment of Key Personnel. Wherein, under the column Site Engineer Bidder has mentioned four (4) no. of Site Engineer. However, in table on page no. 128 of scanned	We have submitted Affidavit regarding deployed 4 Nos. of site Engineers. Please find	As the Bidder has now submitted the CV's, evaluation has been carried out accordingly.	Agreed

Ajay Singh *Q.P. Singh* *Aghe* *Oru*

S. No.	Appendix / Annex No.	Observations	Reply of Bidder	Comments of financial consultant	Comments of ETEC
		documents submitted Bidder has mentioned only one (1) no. of Site Engineer against our requirement of four(4) no. of Site Engineer as per Clause 4.4 B (b) (ii) of RFP. Bidder to clarify.	enclosed herewith details of 4 Nos. Site Engineers as required.		
2.	Clause 4.4 B (b) (ii)	Bidder has not provided CV of any Key Personnel which was required to be submitted as per Notes under table 4.4 B (b) (ii) of RFP. Bidder to clarify.	Please find enclosed herewith CV of key personnel.	As discussed with the Authority (GM-Tech.). CV's may be accepted as these are petty maintenance jobs.	Agreed

d) M/s Garg Sons Estate Promoters Pvt. Ltd.

S. No.	Appendix / Annex No.	Observations	Reply of Bidder	Comments of financial consultant	Comments of ETEC
1.	BANK GUARANTEE FOR BID SECURITY	Bidder has submitted Bank Guarantee for Bid Security, Wherein at para 3 Bidder has mentioned "The guarantee will remain in force upto 07.10.2018 as stated in the Instructions to Biddersbefore the date of expiry of this guarantee" instead of "This guarantee will remain in force upto and including the date 45 days beyond the validity of the bid as stated in the Instructions to Bidders before the date of expiry of this guarantee". Bidder to clarify.	The amendment letter obtained from the Bank vide letter No. SME/2018-191144 Dt. 23.04.18 being enclosed herewith in this regard.	As the Bidder has now submitted the amendment to Bank Guarantee, the same is found in order. Hence Accepted.	Agreed
2.	BANK GUARANTEE FOR BID SECURITY	Bidder was required to submit the complete name and address of the operatable branch of the bank at New Delhi, Wherein at para 3 Bidder has mentioned "This guarantee shall also be operatable at our Parliament Street branch at New Delhi, from whom, confirmation regardingmake payment of amounts so demanded under the said invocation". Instead of ""This guarantee shall also be operatable at our branch at New Delhi, from whom, confirmation regarding payment of amounts so demanded under the said invocation". Bidder to clarify.	The amendment letter obtained from the Bank vide letter No. SME/2018-19/144 Dt. 23.04.18 being enclosed herewith in this regard.	As the bidder has now submitted the amendment to Bank Guarantee, the same is found in order. Hence Accepted.	Agreed
3.	Clause 4.4 A (a)	Bidder has not submitted Average Annual Financial Turnover for last 5 years duly certified from Chartered Accountant which was required to be submitted as per Clause 4.4 A (a) of RFP which stipulates that –" achieved an average annual	The requisite documents has already been attached in uploaded technical	As the Bidder has now provided the requisite information,	Agreed

S. No.	Appendix / Annex No.	Observations	Reply of Bidder	Comments of financial consultant	Comments of ETEC
		financial turnover (in all classes of civil engineering construction works only) equal to the amount indicated in NIT during last five years ending 31st March of the previous financial year duly certified by Chartered Accountant". Bidder to clarify.	documents (Refer page no 96)	evaluation has been carried out accordingly.	
4.	Clause 4.4 A (b)	Bidder has not submitted the project details which was required to submit under Clause 4.4 A (b) which stipulates that – "satisfactorily completed (not less than 90% of contract value), as a prime contractor (or as a nominated subcontractor, provided further that all other qualification criteria are satisfied) similar works during last five years ending last day of month previous to the one in which bids are invited, Experience in successfully completing or substantially completing at least one contract of road i.e. State Highway, National Highway with similar or higher Bituminous work specification of at least 40% of value of proposed Contract within the last five years". Bidder to clarify.	The requisite documents has already been attached in the uploaded technical documents (refer pg. 76-78)	As the Bidder has now provided the requisite information, evaluation has been carried out accordingly.	Agreed
5.	Undertaking 25% value of the work	Bidder has not submitted "Undertaking regarding 25% value of the work during implementation of the Contract towards the working capital" which was required to be submitted as per RFP. Bidder to clarify.	The requisite documents has already been attached in the uploaded technical documents (refer pg. 104)	As the Bidder has now provided the requisite information. evaluation has been carried out accordingly.	Agreed
6.	Clause 4.4 B (b) (ii)	Bidder has not provided CV of Site Engineer, Quantity Surveyor, Soil & Material Engineer Key Personnel which was required to be submitted as per Notes under table 4.4 B (b) (ii) of RFP. Bidder to clarify.	The requisite CV's are being enclosed Herewith.	As the Bidder has now submitted the CV's, evaluation has been carried out accordingly.	Agreed
7.	Clause 4.4 B (b) (ii)	Bidder has submitted a table regarding deployment of Key Personnel. Wherein, under the column Site Engineer Bidder has mentioned three (3) no. of Site Engineer against our requirement of four (4) no. of Site Engineer as per Clause 4.4 B (b) (ii) of RFP. Bidder to clarify.	The revised sheet of technical personnel for construction are being enclosed herewith compliance.	As discussed with the Authority (GM-Tech.). CV's may be accepted as these are petty maintenance jobs.	Agreed

Ajay

Agreed


Agreed

6) Further the financial consultant vide report dated 03.05.2018 has recommended following:

Sl. No.	Name of the Bidder	Annual Average Turnover (in Cr) Rs 7.58 Crores Clause 4.4 (a)	Work of Similar Nature (40 % of estimated project cost) Rs 7.58 Crores Clause 4.4 (b)	Bid Capacity (18.95 Cr) <i>Amk</i>	Eligible/ In eligible
1.	M/s ABCI Infrastructures Pvt. Ltd.	364.08	77.83	147.42	Eligible
2.	M/s HVS Construction Materials Pvt. Ltd.	65.93	10.52	201.18	Eligible
3.	M/s Nidhi Creative Infrastructure Pvt. Ltd.	30.99	38.45	95.53	Eligible
4.	M/s Garg Sons Estate Promoters Pvt. Ltd.	35.34	9.03	27.65	Eligible

7) The Committee deliberated the report of financial consultant in detail and found all the four aforesaid bidders technically responsive for financial opening. Hence the committee decided to open the financial bid of all the bidders viz. **M/s ABCI Infrastructures Pvt. Ltd., M/s HVS Construction Materials Pvt. Ltd., M/s Nidhi Creative Infrastructure Pvt. Ltd. and M/s Garg Sons Estate Promoters Pvt. Ltd.** with the approval of Competent Authority.

Meeting ended with vote of thanks to chair.


Col Ajay Ahluwalia
(Retd)
(ED-I)
Chairman


Sandeep Gupta
(GM-Tech)
Member Secretary


Y C Srivastava
(GM-Tech)
Member


A K Jha
DGM (Tech)
Member


U Chhaterjee
DGM (Finance):
Member